



Migrants and the Bargaining Process in The Labor Market: Application of Ultimatum Game

Serkan DİLEK *, Rumeysa YILDIRIM **

ABSTRACT

International migration movements continue to increase due to reasons such as income differences between countries, wars and turmoil, and political instability. Due to the internal turmoils in nations like Syria, Iraq, and Afghanistan, Turkey is one of the nations that receive the most immigrants. Immigrants are generally employed as cheap labor in the labor market of their country of origin. On the other hand, they may be subjected to negative behaviours by the people of the host country due to cultural differences. The aim of this study is to investigate the tendency to offer low wages to immigrants in Turkey. The existence of the perception that immigrants are willing to work for low wages in Turkey and negative attitudes towards immigrants in the labor market were investigated with the ultimatum game application on Kastamonu University Faculty of Economics and Administrative Sciences students. As a result of the research, no statistically significant difference was found between the wage offer given to the worker candidate whose nationality is unknown and the wage offer given to the worker candidate who is known to be an immigrant. In addition, it was observed that the participants exhibited altruistic behaviours, and those who received offers (responders) with foreign nationality accepted the offers at a higher rate.

Keywords: Immigrants, Labor Market, Wage Negotiations, Racial Differences, Racial Prejudice, Altruism, Ultimatum Game.

JEL Codes: J15, J21, J31

İşgücü Piyasalarında Göçmenler ve Pazarlık Süreci: Ultimatom Oyunu Uygulaması

ÖZ

Ülkeler arasındaki gelir farklılıkları, savaş ve kargaşa, siyasi istikrarsızlık gibi nedenlerle uluslararası göç hareketleri artarak devam etmektedir. Suriye, Irak, Afganistan gibi ülkelerdeki iç karışıklıklar nedeniyle Türkiye en çok göçmen alan ülkelerden biridir. Göçmenler genellikle kendi ülkelerinin işgücü piyasasında ucuz işgücü olarak istihdam edilmektedir. Öte yandan kültürel farklılıklardan dolayı ev sahibi ülkenin insanları tarafından olumsuz davranışlara maruz kalabilmektedirler. Bu çalışmanın amacı, Türkiye'deki göçmenlere düşük ücret teklif etme eğilimini araştırmaktır. Kastamonu Üniversitesi İktisadi ve İdari Bilimler Fakültesi öğrencileri üzerinde ultimatom oyunu uygulaması ile göçmenlerin Türkiye'de düşük ücretle çalışmaya istekli oldukları algısının varlığı ve işgücü piyasasında göçmenlere yönelik olumsuz tutumların varlığı araştırılmıştır. Araştırma sonucunda uyuşu bilinmeyen işçi adayına verilen ücret teklifi ile göçmen olduğu bilinen işçi adayına verilen ücret teklifi arasında istatistiksel olarak anlamlı bir fark bulunmamıştır. Ayrıca katılımcıların özgecil davranışlar sergiledikleri ve yabancı uyruklu teklif alanların (cevap verenlerin) teklifleri daha yüksek oranda kabul ettiği görülmüştür.

Keywords: Göçmenler, İşgücü Piyasaları, Ücret Görüşmeleri, Irksal Farklılıklar, Irksal Önyargı, Diğergamlık, Ultimatom Oyunu

JEL Classification: J15, J21, J31

Geliş Tarihi / Received: 03.10.2022 Kabul Tarihi / Accepted: 22.11.2022

* Prof. Dr., Kastamonu Üniversitesi, İİBF, İktisat Bölümü, serkan.dilek@gmail.com, ORCID: 0000-0002-0393-4509.

** Araş.Gör., Kastamonu Üniversitesi, İİBF, İktisat Bölümü, rumeysayildirim@kastamonu.edu.tr, ORCID: 0000-0002-3956-5127.

1. INTRODUCTION

At the beginning of the 21st century, the economic and political turmoil in South and Southwest Asia (Iraq, Afghanistan, Syria, etc.) increased the migration movements. Especially for those who want to migrate to Europe, Turkey is one of the most important transit points due to its geographical location. The number of Syrian refugees in Turkey in June 2022 is more than 3.6 million (Refugees, 2022). In addition, irregular migration to Turkey from various countries, including Afghanistan, is also substantial (Akkaş & Aksakal, 2021). Turkey stands out as the country hosting the highest number of refugees in the world (Yeni Şafak, 2022). The legal status of the immigrants who came to Turkey from Syria was regulated according to the Temporary Protection Regulation, which was issued in 2014, and this regulation, enabled Syrian immigrants to obtain a work permit (Fansa, 2021, p.302). Field researches show that immigrants, including Syrians, face various problems and difficulties in Turkey (Arslan et al. 2017). The fact that immigrants stay in Turkey for a long time has also revealed the possibility of being permanent (Kesgin, 2022:31).

Immigrants' participation in the labor market has significant social, economic and political consequences. A significant portion of the immigrants in Turkey work for lower wages than the average and even compete with other immigrants and ethnic groups by being willing to work for low wages (Dedeoğlu, 2018; Kocadaş, 2018). In Turkey, the unregistered work of immigrants has also emerged as a frequent phenomenon (Arslan et al. 2017:136). For the development of the Turkish economy, measures should be taken regarding eliminating low pay wages for immigrants and wage differences (Kesgin, 2022:46). Even in developed and well-established economies such as the USA and Europe, ethnic and racial discrimination in labor markets is seen as one of the important problems (Waters & Eschbach, 1995; McCall, 2001, Bertrand & Mullainathan, 2003; Oreopoulos, 2011; Pager et.al. 2009; Tomaskovic -Devey et.al. 2015; Ebner & Helbling, 2016, Hernandez et.al. 2019, Mckee, 2020; Kimberly, 2020; Ingwersen & Thomsen, 2021). On the other hand, cultural differences between societies make it difficult for immigrants to adapt and cause the settled society to react to refugees (Kesgin, 2022:33). One of the reasons for the reaction toward the immigrants is the perception that they are willing to work for low wages and in worse conditions and that they are taking local peoples' jobs (Kocadaş, 2018; Arslan et al. 2017:131).

The high number of immigrants in Turkey, meeting the needs of these immigrants such as shelter and food, and their involvement in the labor market in Turkey has become exciting subjects for various researchers (Dedeoğlu, 2018; Kocadaş, 2018). It is observed that the bargaining power of immigrants in the labor market is generally lower. There is a perception in the labor market that immigrants are asked to work more for lower wages and that immigrants accept these demands. The aim of this study is to investigate the tendency of employers to offer lower wages to immigrants and the tendency to accept lower wage offers. Inspired from the research that previously used games to investigate ethnic or racial discrimination (Fershtman & Gneezy, 2001; Bouckaert & Dhaene, 2004; Ahmed, 2007; Daskalova, 2018; Peyton & Huber, 2018, Hernandez et.al. 2019, Chisadza et.al. 2021), we played an ultimatum game with students from Kastamonu University. The originality of our research is that there is no previous study to examine the bargaining power and bargaining process of immigrants in the Turkish labor market. Another unique aspect of the study is that ultimatum games, which are not used much in academic studies in Turkey, were used in this study (Dilek & Kesgingöz, 2018; Kırış & Dilek, 2021, Tetik & Tetik, 2021). The majority are Muslims in Turkey and discrimination is prohibited in Islam. Investigating discrimination in labor markets in a country where discrimination is prohibited in terms of religion will also encourage new research to be conducted for future studies.

In the first stage of the research, the situation of immigrants in the labor market and the wage bargains of immigrant workers will be examined. In the next stage, the results of the ultimatum game will be discussed and the bargaining power of migrant workers will be examined.

2. IMMIGRANTS IN TURKISH LABOR MARKETS

Since 2011, Turkey has become a country that hosts a large number of immigrants and refugees. The policies followed by the Assad regime in Syria in 2011 enabled a large number of immigrants to enter from Syria to neighbouring countries, especially Turkey (Arslan et al. 2017:132, Dedeoğlu, 2018:40-41, Fansa, 2021: 290; Kesgin, 2022:31). Due to the political developments and civil wars, there has been an intense flow of immigrants to Turkey from countries such as Iraq, Afghanistan, Russia and Ukraine (Akkaş & Aksakal, 2021:44).

It is possible to talk about two reasons for migration to Turkey. First; Turkey is a transit country for migration from the sending country to Europe (Alakuş & Uzan, 2020:94). Secondly; Turkey is an attraction point and destination country for immigrants due to its stable political and economic structure (Arslan et al. 2017:130; Kocadaş, 2018:2). The fact that the immigrants, thought to be temporary at first, have lived in Turkey for a long time has also revealed the possibility that they will become permanent over time. Over time, immigrants began to work in Turkey in a variety of jobs.

It is observed that most of the immigrants work with low wages and bad conditions after they enter the Turkish labor market (Dedeoğlu, 2018:38; Kocadaş, 2018:6). The impact of skilled labor migration and low-skilled labor migration on the host country's economy is not the same (Das et.al. 2021). There are also many unregistered immigrants in Turkey (Arslan et al. 2017:136). These facts cause the bargaining power of immigrants in the labor market to be questioned. Because the acceptance of unregistered work by immigrants for low wages causes the general level of wages to decrease and the local people to react negatively to this (Kocadaş, 2018:8). On the other hand, researches show that minorities and immigrants are expected to bargain less in the labor market, and employers tend to punish if they negotiate hard (Hernandez et.al. 2019, Gligor et.al. 2021).

3. BARGAINING PROCESSES IN LABOUR MARKETS (LITERATURE REVIEW)

It has also emerged in studies conducted in the labor markets of immigrants and other societies where minority groups are paid low and the majority is favoured (Ahmed, 2007, Oreopoulos, 2011; Mckee, 2020; Kimberly, 2020; Chisadza et.al. 2021; Tomaskovic-Devey et.al. 2015). Elimination of negative discriminatory practices against minorities and immigrants in the labor market makes them participate more in the social process and their contribution to society increases (Bao et.al. 2022). Therefore, it is essential that there be no discrimination against immigrants in the labor market in order for immigrants to expand their contribution to the Turkish economy. There are different reasons for the low wages of immigrants in society in the economics literature. These reasons can be listed as follows.

First; it is the distrust of employers and society towards immigrants. Fershtman & Gneezy (2001) found that there is distrust towards men of eastern origin in the Israeli Jewish community. In general, there are studies showing that there is distrust towards Middle Eastern origins and blacks in Western societies, but there are also studies in the literature indicating that there is no distrust (Bouckaert and Dhaene, 2004).

Secondly; there is the tendency of the majority to favour their own groups. There is no prejudice or reaction against immigrants here, but the majority favours people who are in the same group as is done in the labor market (Ahmed, 2007; Pager et.al. 2009; Daskalova, 2018; Dilek et.al. 2019). Favouritism reduces the productivity of the workers other than the favoured and negatively affects the economy (Dilek et.al. 2019:3189). Although it is discussed in the literature that the local people favour those with the same ethnic origin, it is noteworthy that there are limited studies investigating the reasons (Oreopoulos, 2011; Pager et.al. 2009; Tomaskovic-Devey et.al. 2015; Kimberly 2020).

Thirdly; is the disadvantage of immigrants in the labor market due to the social gap between natives and immigrants (Ebner & Helbling, 2016). Groups that do not have social gap between them behave more cooperatively towards each other. The reasons for the increase in social gap between immigrants and locals are that they have different cultures, are educated in different systems and communicate in different languages. This social gap sometimes reaches up to racism and causes immigrants to have difficulties in the labor market (Peyton & Huber, 2018). However, new studies offer encouraging results for the elimination of race-based assessments in labor markets. Higher wages are paid to whites in short-term evaluations, but it is seen that the difference between the wages paid to blacks and whites decreases as the duration is extended (Chisadza et.al., 2021).

Competition in secondary labor markets is often experienced between different immigrant groups. There are two primary reasons for this. The first reason is that local people are not willing to work in secondary labor markets. While there are permanent employment contracts and higher quality of work in the primary labor markets, there are temporary employment contracts and worse working conditions in the secondary labor markets (Dekker & Van der Veen, 2017:257; Leontaridi, 1998:69). The second reason is that immigrants' lack of education and skills prevents them from working in primary markets. In order to work in primary labor markets, workers must have certain skills (high-skilled). Piore (1979) also attributes migration movements to the constant need for low-wage workers in the receiving country. In short, migration is mostly in the form of low-skilled labor movement.

Low-skilled labor migration increases the productivity of high-skilled domestic labor. In other words, it causes the local people to exploit the low-skilled migrant workforce (Lin & Weiss, 2019). Despite this, low-skilled labor migration is met with more reactions by the locals than high-skilled labor migration. The reason for this is the belief that low-skilled domestic workforce has the belief which is that immigrants are taking away their jobs. On the other hand, high-skilled labor migration is met with a lower response by low-skilled domestic labor. Highly skilled labor migration controls income inequality and causes wages to rise (Das et.al. 2020).

One of the reasons why minorities and immigrants are disadvantaged in the labor market is the inequality of opportunity in education. Even in the most developed democracies, it is not easy to say that minorities and immigrants have equal opportunities in education with the majority in education. When the rates of getting a law degree and being an administrator and company partner in law firms are examined in the USA, it is seen that the ratio of blacks and Hispanics is very low (Kimberly, 2020:35). This shows that the education of immigrants in Turkey is important both to adapt to the local culture and to compete on equal terms in the labor market. Between 1994 and 2015, the human capital of immigrants in Germany deteriorated gradually, and as a result, the wage differentials between locals and immigrants gradually increased (Ingwersen & Thomsen, 2021).

There are four different results of the disadvantage of immigrants in the labor market compared to the local people. First; as explained above, immigrants are mostly employed in secondary labor markets. Secondly; immigrants are mostly found in certain labor lines. Since they are unfamiliar with the work market in their new country, newcomers turn to other

immigrants that have come before for assistance. As a result, it is seen that immigrants are concentrated in the business lines of those who have migrated before (Bailey & Waldinger, 1991:443-444). Third, the number of self-employed among immigrants is higher than that of the local population. Wilson & Portes (1980) introduced the concept of immigrant enclaves to the literature. Some of the immigrants can establish businesses in the geographical areas where immigrants are concentrated. Immigrants still work in these businesses and they operate for immigrants. For the second and third reasons, the relations of immigrants with the settled society remain at a minimum level and it becomes difficult for them to adapt to the settled society. The fourth is that they are willing to work for a lower wage than the local people despite doing the same job. Our study also explores whether immigrants are willing to pay lower wages in labor markets and whether local employers are inclined to offer immigrants lower wages.

4. METHOD

In order to implement the ultimatum game, announcements were made in the classrooms, and announcements were posted in the canteen and cafeteria. The research was carried out in April-June 2022. People who want to participate in the game are divided into two groups as proposers and responders. The proposer attends a class with the interviewer; the participant who received the offer was also taken to another class with another interviewer. The interviewees gave the Informed Consent form to both the proposers and the responders to read. After the interviewees read the informed consent form, they filled out the questionnaire form given to them. Then the bidder was given 100 TL to get a job done and was asked to make an offer to share it with the other party. It is stated that if the bidder accepts this offer, 100 TL will be shared between the two according to the offer, and if they refuse, both will leave the game with zero TL. The interviewer directed the offer of the proposer to the interviewer in the room of the responder. The interviewer also passed on the answer to the person who received the offer. In 50 of the 130 experiments carried out, the proposer was informed that the person responding to the offer was not a citizen of the Republic of Turkey, and that they were a foreign national. In 80 experiments, the proposer was not informed about the nationality of the responder. After the experiment was concluded, gifts were given to all participants.

5. FINDINGS

Demographic characteristics of two separate groups, proposers and responders, are given in Table 1. As it is seen, it is seen that both the proposers and the responders are mainly in the 20-22 age group. 56.1% of the proposers; 61.6% of the responders are in the 20-22 age group. In addition, it is seen that the household income of most of the participants is between 4201-8000 TL. It is seen that the household income of 49.2% of the proposers; and 57% of the responders is between 4201-8000 TL. The minimum wage in Turkey between April and June 2022, when the survey was conducted, is 4200 TL, which indicates that most of the participants have a household income slightly above the minimum wage. More than 60% of the proposers and the responders are male. Most of the participants have 4-5 people in their family. 50.8% of the proposers and 59.3% of the responders have 4-5 people in their family. It is seen that the majority of the participants' families live in the Black Sea region. Kastamonu University is located in the Black Sea region and naturally the majority of its students are of Black Sea origin. Foreign participants include those from Azerbaijan, Indonesia, Somalia, Yemen, Turkmenistan, Syria, Kyrgyzstan, Afghanistan, Guinea, Saudi Arabia, Pakistan, Mali and Iraq.

Table 1: Demographic Characteristics of Participants in the Ultimatum Game

Proposers			Responders		
Age	F	%	Age	F	%
18-19	15	11.5	18-19	7	5.4
20	23	17.7	20	21	16.2
21	22	16.9	21	25	19.2
22	28	21.5	22	34	26.2
23	15	11.5	23	16	12.3
24+	27	20.8	24+	27	20.8
Total	130	100	Total	130	100
Monthly Income			Monthly Income		
	F	%		F	%
0- 4200 TL	36	27.7	0-4200 TL	32	24.6
4201-6000 TL	40	30.8	4201-6000 TL	53	40.8
6001- 8000 TL	25	19.2	6001- 8000 TL	21	16.2
8001-10,000 TL	13	10	8001-10,000 TL	16	12.3
10,001 + TL	16	12.3	10,001 + TL	8	6.2
Total	130	100	Total	130	100
Gender			Gender		
	F	%		F	%
Male	81	62.3	Male	87	66.9
Female	49	37.7	Female	43	33.1
Total	130	100	Total	130	100
Average Person in Household			Average Person in Household		
	F	%		F	%
1	2	1.5	1	0	0
2	2	1.5	2	4	3.1
3	19	14.6	3	16	12.3
4	43	33.1	4	43	33.1
5	23	17.7	5	34	26.2
6+	41	31.6	6+	33	25.4
Total	130	100	Total	130	100
Region Where Family Lives			Region Where Family Lives		
	F	%		F	%
Marmara	9	6.9	Marmara	11	8.5
Aegean	2	1.5	Aegean	2	1.5
Mediterranean	12	9.2	Mediterranean	4	3.1
Black Sea	44	33.8	Black Sea	34	26.2
Central Anatolia	19	14.6	Central Anatolia	10	7.7
Eastern Anatolia	3	2.3	Eastern Anatolia	1	0.7
South-eastern Anatolia	5	3.8	South-eastern Anatolia	3	2.3
Foreign Country	36	27.7	Foreign Country	65	50.0

The offers received as a result of the ultimatum game are given in Table 2 below. The average bid amount was found to be 46.38TL. The maximum bid is 90 TL. In other words, the proposers did not make the lowest bid by thinking like a rational Homo economicus individual, they acted more altruistically. This result is consistent with the results of previous studies (Dilek & Kesgingöz, 2018; Kırıtı & Dilek, 2021).

Table 2: Proposed Offers

Proposed Amount	F	%
10 TL	2	1.5
20 TL	3	2.3
30 TL	19	14.6
40 TL	20	15.4
50 TL	73	56.2
60 TL	6	4.6
70 TL	2	1.5
80 TL	2	1.5
90 TL	3	2.3

In 50 of the 130 experimental groups, the person who would submit the offer was informed that the person who would respond to the offer was not a Turkish citizen. In these 50 experiments, those who would respond to the proposal were selected from among non-Turkish citizens. In the remaining 80 experiments, the proposer was not informed about the nationality of the person who would respond to the offer.

Table 3: Nationality of Respondent Known and Unknown

Foreign National is Known About Responder			Nothing Is Known About Responder		
Proposed Amount	F	%	Proposed Amount	F	%
10 TL	2	4.0	10 TL	0	0
20 TL	0	0	20 TL	3	3.75
30 TL	8	16.0	30 TL	11	13.75
40 TL	10	20.0	40 TL	10	12.5
50 TL	26	52.0	50 TL	47	58.75
60 TL	1	2.0	60 TL	5	6.25
70 TL	0	0	70 TL	2	2.5
80 TL	1	2.0	80 TL	1	1.25
90 TL	2	4.0	90 TL	1	1.25
Total	50	100	Total	80	100

It has been tested whether the bid amounts comply with the normal distribution. According to this result, it will be decided whether parametric tests will be applied in hypothesis tests. Bid amounts do not follow the normal distribution (Shapiro-Wilk sig:0.000; Kolmogorov-Smirnov sig:0.000). Skewness and Kurtosis values also show that they do not show normal distribution (Skewness: 0.464; Kurtosis: 2.790). For this reason, parametric tests were preferred.

H1: The offer made when it is known that the Responder is not a Turkish Citizen is different from the offer made when the nationality of the Responder is not known.

Since it was seen that the series did not comply with the normal distribution, the Mann-Whitney U test, which is a non-parametric test, was applied and it was observed that the bids proposed when it was known that the responder was not a Turkish citizen and the bids proposed when it was not known were not statistically different (z:-1.038; sig2: 0.299). Even if the Independent Sample T test, which is a parametric test, was applied, the result would not change and it would be seen that there was no difference (Sig2: 0.588). When it is known that the responder is not a Turkish citizen, the average bid is 45.60 TL; when it was unknown, the average bid was 46.88 TL. The difference between the two average bids is not statistically significant.

H2: Bids differ according to the proposer's income.

Kruskal Wallis test was preferred because the series did not fit the normal distribution and it was seen that the bids did not differ according to the income level of the proposer (Chi-Square: 4,577; Sig:0.334). While the average bid made by those with a monthly income of less than 4200 TL is 42.50 TL, the average bid made by those with a monthly income between 4201-6000 TL is 49.50 TL; those with a monthly income between 6001-8000 TL offered 46.00 TL; the average bid of those with a monthly income between 8001-10000 TL is 50.77 TL, and the bid of those who earn over 10000 TL per month is 44.38 TL.

H3: Bids made differ according to the Gender of the proposer.

The Mann-Whitney U test was performed and it was concluded that there was no statistically significant difference between the offers made by men and women (z:-0.130, sig2:0.896). While men offered an average of 47.16 TL, women offered an average of 45.10 TL.

Table 4: Acceptance and Rejection

Proposed Amount	F	Acceptance	Rejection	Acceptance Rate (%)
10 TL	2	2	0	100
20 TL	3	1	2	33.3
30 TL	19	12	7	63.2
40 TL	20	13	7	65
50 TL	73	64	9	87.7
60 TL	6	6	0	100
70 TL	2	2	0	100
80 TL	2	2	0	100
90 TL	3	3	0	100

In Table 4, the rejection and acceptance decisions given to the proposals are discussed. Both bids of 10 TL were accepted. None of the offers of 20 TL were accepted. Only 62.5% of the offers of 30 TL or less were accepted. The higher the bid amount, the higher the acceptance rate. All bids of 60 TL or more have been accepted. In other words, the higher the bid amount, the higher the acceptance rate.

Table 5 also gives the opportunity to compare the acceptance rates in cases where the responders are known to be foreign nationals and when they are not. While the average acceptance rate of the offers is 92% when the responders are known to be foreign nationals, the average acceptance rate is 73.75% when the responders are not known to be foreign nationals. In 65 of the 130 experiments, the responders to the bid were foreign nationals, and these 65 experiments had a high acceptance rate of 89.2%. In 65 experiments where the responders were Turkish citizens, the acceptance rate was 72.30%. In other words, the acceptance rate of foreign national responders is higher.

Table 5: Acceptance Rates Based on Knowing Whether the Bid Recipients Are Foreigners

Foreign National is Known About Responder			Nothing Is Known About Responder		
Proposed Amount	F	Acceptance Rate	Proposed Amount	F	Acceptance Rate
10 TL	2	100	10 TL	0	-
20 TL	0	-	20 TL	3	33.3
30 TL	8	87.5	30 TL	11	45.5

40 TL	10	90	40 TL	10	40.0
50 TL	26	92.3	50 TL	47	85.1
60 TL	1	100	60 TL	5	100
70 TL	0	-	70 TL	2	100
80 TL	1	100	80 TL	1	100
90 TL	2	100	90 TL	1	100
Total	50	100	Total	80	100

6. CONCLUSION AND DISCUSSION

Our research aimed to examine the tendency to offer low wages to immigrants in the labor market and the attitude of immigrants to be willing to work for low wages. For this reason, the ultimatum game was applied. The important limitation of the study is that it was conducted on the students of Kastamonu University. Naturally, the majority of the participants are Black Sea origin, university students living in Kastamonu and its surroundings. Black Sea culture and conservative Islamic tendencies are likely to have an impact on the results of our research. In addition, there is a possibility that university students cannot adequately represent the employer's attitude. For this reason, it will be useful to conduct further research on employers rather than university students in Turkey and other parts of the world to reveal attitudes towards immigrants. Based on the fact that Kastamonu is a small city centre, a similar study to be carried out in metropolitan cities such as Istanbul or Ankara may reach different results. The importance of our research is that it is the first study in Turkey to examine labor markets with the ultimatum game. There are also a limited number of ultimatum games to explore different topics (Dilek & Kesgingöz, 2018; Kırış & Dilek, 2021; Hatipoğlu, 2021; Tetik & Tetik, 2021).

In our study, the proposers in the first 50 experiments were informed that those who would respond to the offer were not citizens of the Republic of Turkey. In the other 80 experiments, no information was given about the nationalities of those who would respond to the offer. There was no statistically significant difference between the proposals given in the two experimental groups. In short, we did not find enough evidence of the tendency regarding offering low wages to immigrants in the labor market in Turkey. There are studies in the literature suggesting that low wages are offered to foreign nationals and in cases where these offers are not accepted, there is a reaction (Hernandez et.al. 2019, Gligor et.al. 2021, MacDonald & Hasmath, 2019). The reason why we have reached different results from these researches is that the societies in which the researches are conducted have different value judgments, culture, religion, etc. The study conducted by Kahveci (2019) in the Istanbul Textile industry concluded that Syrians work for lower wages in Turkey, but their wages increase as their Turkish language skills increase. In future studies, it can be investigated whether there is a difference between the Istanbul labor market and the Anatolian labor market in terms of behaviour towards migrant workers.

It was observed that the bid amount did not differ according to the gender and income level of the proposer. In the literature, factors such as ethnicity and gender may cause discrimination in the labor market; there are studies showing that people tend to favour people from the group they belong to (Fershtman & Gneezy, 2001; Ahmed, 2007; Daskalova, 2018; Hernandez et.al. 2019; MacDonald & Hasmath, 2019). Even in developed economies, there are

studies showing that groups such as blacks and Hispanics are discriminated in the labor market (Peyton & Huber, 2018, Chisadza et.al. 2021). Turkey's social structure, culture and inclusiveness of the religion of Islam may be an obstacle to discrimination in the labor market, but this requires more extensive research.

Our analysis also shows that the average bid of the participants is 46.38 TL, in this case, they offer to share almost half of the money given to them. This shows that the participants behave altruistically. In addition, 62.5% of the offers of 30 TL or less and 100% of the offers of 60 TL and above were accepted. Thus, it shows that at least some of those who responded to the offer did not act rationally and responded angrily to the offer that they thought was unfair. Dilek & Kesgingöz (2018); Kırış & Dilek, (2021) research also supports our research on people's altruistic behaviours. On the other hand, studies such as Tetik & Tetik (2021) show that factors such as education in economics can affect people's altruistic behaviours.

Another result is that the responders that are of foreign nationality accept the offers at a higher rate. It was observed that 89.2% of the foreign responders accepted the offers, while the Turkish citizen's acceptance rate is 72.30%. This result can actually explain why foreign nationals work for lower wages in the labor market. Why foreign nationals or immigrants accept lower wage offers is an interesting topic for future researchers. There are also studies in the literature that immigrants tend to accept lower wage offers (Brownell, 2010).

Araştırma ve Yayın Etiği Beyanı

Bu çalışma bilimsel araştırma ve yayın etiği kurallarına uygun olarak hazırlanmıştır. Kastamonu Üniversitesi Rektörlüğü Sosyal ve Beşeri Bilimler Araştırma ve Yayın Etiği Kurulu'nun 17.05.2022 tarihinde beşinci toplantı yedinci kararı.

Yazarların Makaleye Katkı Oranları

Yazar 1'in makaleye katkısı %55, Yazar 2'nin makaleye katkısı %45.'dir.

Çıkar Beyanı

Yazarlar açısından ya da üçüncü taraflar açısından çalışmadan kaynaklı çıkar çatışması bulunmamaktadır.

REFERENCES

- Ahmed, A. M. (2007). Group Identity, Social Distance and Intergroup Bias. *Journal of economic psychology*, 28(3), 324-337. <https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0167487007000098>. Erişim Tarihi:08.06.2022
- Akkaş, İ. ve Aksakal, İ. (2021). Afgan Göçmenlere Yönelik Tutum ve Algıların Sosyolojik Analizi: Erzincan Örneği. *Sosyolojik Bağlam Dergisi*, 2(3), 41-54. doi:10.52108/2757-5942.2.3.3. <https://aperta.ulakbim.gov.tr/record/228205#.Y5hsPlwzaM8>. Erişim:08.06.2022
- Alakuş, E., & Uzan, Y. (2020). İnsan Ticaretine Konu Olma Potansiyeli Bakımından Türkiye'nin Afgan Düzensiz Göçmen Gerçeği. *Göç Araştırmaları Dergisi*, 6(1), 92-117. <https://dergipark.org.tr/en/pub/gad/issue/55181/757003>. Erişim:10.07.2022
- Arslan, İ., Bozgeyik, Y., & Alancioğlu, E. (2017). Göçün Ekonomik Ve Toplumsal Yansımaları: Gaziantep'teki Suriyeli Göçmenler Örneği/Socio-Economic Reflections of Migration: The Example of Syrian Immigrants in Gaziantep. *İlahiyat Akademi*, (4), 129-148. <https://dergipark.org.tr/en/pub/ilak/issue/28571/304912>. Erişim:11.07.2022
- Bailey, T. & Waldinger, R. (1991). Primary, Secondary, and Enclave Labor Markets: A Training Systems Approach *American Sociological Review*, 56(4). 432-445. https://www.jstor.org/stable/2096266#metadata_info_tab_contents. Erişim:01.11.2022
- Bao, T., Liang, B., & Pei, J. (2022). Does ethnic diversity always undermine pro-social behavior? Evidence from a laboratory experiment. *European Journal of Political Economy*, 72, 102119. <https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0176268021001014>. Erişim:08.06.2022

- Bertrand, M., & Mullainathan, S. (2004). Are Emily and Greg more employable than Lakisha and Jamal? A field experiment on labor market discrimination. *American economic review*, 94(4), 991-1013. <https://www.aeaweb.org/articles?id=10.1257/0002828042002561>. Erişim:12.06.2022
- Bouckaert, J., & Dhaene, G. (2004). Inter-ethnic Trust and Reciprocity: Results of An Experiment with Small Businessmen. *European Journal of Political Economy*, 20(4), 869-886. <https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0176268004000266>. Erişim: 08.06.2022
- Brownell, P. B. (2010). Wages Differences Between Temporary and Permanent Immigrants. *International Migration Review*, 44(3), 593-614. <https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/pdf/10.1111/j.1747-7379.2010.00819.x>. Erişim:09.06.2022
- Chisadza, C., Nicholls, N., & Yitbarek, E. (2021). Group identity in fairness decisions: Discrimination or inequality aversion? *Journal of Behavioral and Experimental Economics*, 93, 101722. <https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S2214804321000628>. Erişim:08.06.2022
- Das, G. G., Marjit, S., & Kar, M. (2020). The impact of immigration on skills, innovation and wages: Education matters more than where people come from. *Journal of Policy Modeling*, 42(3), 557-582. <https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0161893820300181>. Erişim:08.06.2022
- Daskalova, V. (2018). Discrimination, social identity, and coordination: An experiment. *Games and Economic Behavior*, 107, 238-252. <https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0899825617301793>. Erişim:12.06.2022
- Dedeoğlu, S. (2018). Tarımsal Üretimde Göçmen İşçiler: Yoksulluk Nöbetinden Yoksulların Rekabetine. *Calisma ve Toplum*, 56(1), 715-731. <https://eds.s.ebscohost.com/eds/pdfviewer/pdfviewer?vid=0&sid=7795ac3a-4d40-4838-85c9-22246fcd22f1%40redis>. Erişim: 06.07.2022
- Dekker, F., & van der Veen, R. (2017). Modern working life: a blurring of the boundaries between secondary and primary labour markets? *Economic and Industrial Democracy*, 38(2), 256-270. [chrome-extension://efaidnbmnnnibpcajpcglclefindmkaj/https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Fabian-Dekker-2/publication/271198927_Modern_working_life_A_blurring_of_the_boundaries_between_secondary_and_primary_labour_markets/links/589f0efe45851598bab6ef67/Modern-working-life-A-blurring-of-the-boundaries-between-secondary-and-primary-labour-markets.pdf](https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Fabian-Dekker-2/publication/271198927_Modern_working_life_A_blurring_of_the_boundaries_between_secondary_and_primary_labour_markets/links/589f0efe45851598bab6ef67/Modern-working-life-A-blurring-of-the-boundaries-between-secondary-and-primary-labour-markets.pdf). Erişim:09.06.2022
- Dilek, S., & Kesgingöz, H. (2018). Sharing is Beautiful: An Application of Ultimatum Game. *Business & Management Studies: An International Journal*, 6(4), 822-834. <https://www.bmij.org/index.php/1/article/view/852.1>. Erişim:08.06.2022
- Dilek, S., Özdirek, R., Kesgingöz, H. (2019). Kayırmacılık Kavramının İslam Ekonomisi Bağlamında İncelenmesi. *İnsan ve Toplum Bilimleri Araştırmaları Dergisi*, 8 (4), 3186-3210. Retrieved from <http://www.itobiad.com/tr/issue/49747/618637>. Erişim:11.07.2022
- Ebner, C., & Helbling, M. (2016). Social distance and wage inequalities for immigrants in Switzerland. *Work, employment and society*, 30(3), 436-454. https://www.ssoar.info/ssoar/bitstream/handle/document/65172/ssoar-wes-2016-3-ebner_et_al-Social_distance_and_wage_inequalities.pdf?sequence=1&isAllowed=y. Erişim: 08.06.2022
- Fansa, M. (2021). Kimim Ben? Göçmen, Sığınmacı, Mülteci, Yabancı, Vatansız ve Geçici Koruma: Türkiye'deki Suriyeliler. *Antakiyat*, 4(2), 289-306. <https://dergipark.org.tr/en/pub/antakiyat/issue/65976/1019445>. Erişim:09.06.2022
- Fershtman, C., & Gneezy, U. (2001). Discrimination in A Segmented Society: An Experimental Approach. *The Quarterly Journal of Economics*, 116(1), 351-377. <https://academic.oup.com/qje/article-abstract/116/1/351/1939071>. Erişim:10.06.2022
- Gligor, D., Newman, C., & Kashmiri, S. (2021). Does your skin color matter in buyer–seller negotiations? The implications of being a Black salesperson. *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science*, 49(5), 969-993. <https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s11747-021-00768-0>. Erişim:09.06.2022
- Hatipoğlu, Y. Z. (2021). Metodolojik Bireye Bir Eleştiri; Özgeçlilik Kavramı ve Ültimatom Oyunu Uygulaması. *İnsan ve Toplum*, 11(3), 139-177. <https://dergipark.org.tr/en/pub/insanvetoplum/issue/71119/1138966>. Erişim:10.06.2022
- Hernandez, M., Avery, D. R., Volpone, S. D., & Kaiser, C. R. (2019). Bargaining while Black: The role of race in salary negotiations. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 104(4), 581-592. <https://psycnet.apa.org/record/2018-51751-001>. Erişim:08.06.2022
- Ingwersen, K., & Thomsen, S. L. (2021). The immigrant-native wage gap in Germany revisited. *The Journal of Economic Inequality*, 19(4), 825-854. <https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s10888-021-09493-8>. Erişim:09.06.2022

- Kahveci, M. (2019). Misafirlikten İkinci Sınıf İşçiliğe: Türkiyeli ve Suriyeli İşçiler Arasında Ücret Ayrımcılığı. *Bulletin of Economic Theory and Analysis*, 4(2), 97-118. <https://dergipark.org.tr/en/pub/beta/issue/50414/551359>. Erişim:28.08.2022
- Kesgin, B. (2022). Geçicilikten Kalcılığa Suriyeli Göçmenler ve Uyum Sorunu. *Anasay*, (19), 29-49. <https://dergipark.org.tr/en/pub/anasay/issue/68728/1034459>. Erişim:06.07.2022
- Kırış, Ş., & Dilek, S. (2021). Müslüman Dindarlık Tipolojileri ile Diğerkâmlık Arası İlişkilerin İncelemesi: Ultimatom ve Diktatör Oyunu Uygulaması. *İnsan ve Toplum Bilimleri Araştırmaları Dergisi*, 10(2), 1470-1492. <https://dergipark.org.tr/en/pub/itobiad/article/883683>. Erişim:09.06.2022
- Kimberly J.N. (2020). Gender Bias as the Norm in the Legal Profession: It's Still a [White] Man's Game, *Wash. ULL & Pol'y*, 62, 25-50. <https://heinonline.org/HOL/LandingPage?handle=hein.journals/wajlp62&div=7&id=&page=>. Erişim:08.06.2022
- Kocadaş, B. (2018). Suriyeli Sığınmacılar ve Çalışma Hayatı: Sorunlar, Tespitler ve Öneriler. *Sosyolojik Düşün*, 3(1-2), 1-13. <https://dergipark.org.tr/en/pub/sosdus/issue/41925/500018>. Erişim:06.07.2022
- Leontaridi, M. (1998). Segmented labour markets: theory and evidence. *Journal of economic surveys*, 12(1), 103-109. https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1111/1467-6419.00048?casa_token=JVeOkD8Xi7QAAAAA:g4Jwq5JEUWq87Q34vmsFibcx814uQVW1TjCl8cRBnJRI9gQmX0TCcQfxZ7EO3oxahfJ26IBycc4NjAg. Erişim:01.11.2022
- Lin, K. H., & Weiss, I. (2019). Immigration and the wage distribution in the United States. *Demography*, 56(6), 2229-2252. <https://read.dukeupress.edu/demography/article/56/6/2229/168073/Immigration-and-the-Wage-Distribution-in-the>. Erişim:08.06.2022
- McCall, L. (2001). Sources of Racial Wage Inequality in Metropolitan Labor Markets: Racial, Ethnic, and Gender Differences. *American Sociological Review*, 66(4), 520-541. https://www.jstor.org/stable/3088921#metadata_info_tab_contents. Erişim:08.06.2022
- MacDonald, A. W., & Hasmath, R. (2019). Outsider ethnic minorities and wage determination in China. *International Labour Review*, 158(3), 489-508. https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/full/10.1111/ilr.12074?casa_token=bGjXs3UyW5MAAAAA%3AzRRB64nXIQk7nEdTCUauRH536ahSIh6Nqt5DBf07oIm38Ax7L9M7-7k0iq0VUdTXBWiUSYa9BUAu6VM. Erişim:06.08.2022
- McKee, K. (2020). Can A Higher Minimum Wage Rate Help Close The Persistent Racial Wage And Earnings Gaps?. *The Public Purpose Journal*. XVII, 17-35. <https://thepublicpurpose.com/wp-content/uploads/2021/06/kimberly-mckee-can-minimum-wage-rate-close-the-racial-wage-gap.pdf>. Erişim:12.06.2022
- Mülteciler (2022). <https://mülteciler.org.tr/turkiyedeki-suriyeli-sayisi/>
- Piore, M.J. (1979). *Birds of Passage- Migrant Labor and Industrial Societies*, Cambridge University Pres, Cambridge.
- Oreopoulos, P. (2011). Why do skilled immigrants struggle in the labor market? A field experiment with thirteen thousand resumes. *American Economic Journal: Economic Policy*, 3(4), 148-171. <https://www.aeaweb.org/articles?id=10.1257/pol.3.4.148>. Erişim:12.06.2022
- Pager, D., Bonikowski, B., & Western, B. (2009). Discrimination in a low-wage labor market: A field experiment. *American sociological review*, 74(5), 777-799. <https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.1177/000312240907400505>. Erişim:12.06.2022
- Peyton, K., & Huber, G. A. (2018). Do survey measures of racial prejudice predict racial discrimination? experimental evidence on anti-black discrimination. *SocArXiv. Published online April, 18*. <https://www.semanticscholar.org/paper/Do-Survey-Measures-of-Racial-Prejudice-Predict-on-Peyton/c99ff63bdf73dbc76c2334ac8370c1c28415bda2>. Erişim:08.06.2022
- Tetik, M., & Tetik, G. (2021). Ultimatum Game Bargaining Behaviour: A Classroom Experiment. *Studies in Microeconomics*, 23210222211024432, June, 1-17. https://www.researchgate.net/publication/352761064_Ultimatum_Game_Bargaining_Behaviour_A_Classroom_Experiment. Erişim:08.06.2022
- Tomaskovic-Devey, D., Hällsten, M., & Avent-Holt, D. (2015). Where do immigrants fare worse? Modeling workplace wage gap variation with longitudinal employer-employee data. *American Journal of Sociology*, 120(4), 1095-1143. <https://www.journals.uchicago.edu/doi/abs/10.1086/679191>. Erişim:08.06.2022
- Yeni Şafak (2022). <https://www.yenisafak.com/gundem/multecilere-ev-sahipligi-yapan-ulkeler-siralamasi-degisti-polonya-pakistani-gecti-3769547>. (14.03.2022).

Waters, M. C., & Eschbach, K. (1995). Immigration and ethnic and racial inequality in the United States. *Annual review of sociology*, 419-446. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/2083417>. Eriřim:08.06.2022

Wilson, K. & Portes, A. (1980). Immigrant Enclaves: An Analysis of the Labor Market Experiences of Cubans in Miami. *American Journal of Sociology*, 86 (2). 295-319. https://www.jstor.org/stable/2778666#metadata_info_tab_contents. Eriřim:10.06.2022